



The City of Seattle

## Pioneer Square Preservation Board

Mailing Address: PO Box 94649, Seattle WA 98124-4649

Street Address: 600 4th Avenue, 4th Floor

PSB 121/21

### Staff ARC REPORT

From ARC July 28, 2021 for August 4, 2021

Board Members Please Note: The citations from the District Ordinance, Rules for the Pioneer Square Preservation District, and Secretary of the Interior's Standards listed below are for your consideration in addition to any other citations you find relevant in considering each application.

**080420.3**      **Grand Central, City Loan and Buttnick Buildings**      Becca Pheasant-Reis, Scott Clark  
(Squire Latimer, Gottstein, Brunswick-Balke-Collender)  
216, 206 and 202 1<sup>st</sup> Ave S

Proposed alterations to the buildings including  
    penthouse addition,  
    replacement of windows and storefronts  
    removing non original greenhouse structure  
    adding new openings for new storefronts and doors and one vent,  
    removing ivy and repairing brick,  
    adding lighting,  
    seismic upgrades,  
    new rooftop mechanical equipment,  
Retains type of uses but changes the floorplan of uses,  
Alterations to the areaways,  
Replacement of the alley pavers

Staff report: The applicant last briefed the Board on August 5, 2020.

v

ARC report: Alise Kuwahara Day and Lynda Collie attended ARC on July 28. Ms. Collie recused herself.

The project presented the following new items:

Alternations to the north wall of the City Loan Building: Large expanses of the wall are proposed for removal. Fill is proposed for existing windows. Responding to questions the applicant explained that a beam will be installed and that the replaced section of one of the doors goes from top to bottom and is part of the structural

enhancement of the building. They said a second egress is required and that there was not other way the egress could be provided.

Window replacement: A window survey and inventory has been provided. The survey indicates that the windows are more contemporary replacement windows apart from stained-glass window transoms and the detailed arch window. The applicant explained that the arched window and the stained glass will be repaired and retained. All other windows are proposed to be replaced with new aluminum clad wood windows.

Color pallet: Review of the new storefronts, windows and other materials. In the past the Board has maintained that building should retain their own color pallet as individual building would even when they are combined internally. Ms. Day suggested consideration of breaking up the storefronts colors to further differentiate the three different buildings. The applicant has proposed a grey color on the City Loan Building.

Cornice on City Loan: the cornice was previously removed. Proposal is to add a cornice back but not to recreate the former cornice design.

Lighting: renderings of the effect of proposed lighting in included.

Alley paver replacement. The alley is essentially original cobble. They proposal is to remove the cobble and replace it with brick and stone. The brick and stone proposed is the same material as the new brick and stone in the "Nord alley" design. Ms. Day said that she understood the "Nord Design" intention to be to try to reuse the historic material at the building edge out of the ADA path of travel and then to supplement with new brick and stone. She aske if they looked at trying to incorporate any of the cobble. The applicant said they had not and had assumed that all the material should be replaced. Ms. Day suggested that they consider if retaining some cobble is possible. The applicant has changed their proposal to include reusing one row of cobble at the building edge. This appears to replace what is concrete strip on other buildings. They also revised their drawing to show more fading from brick to stone on the building side and more mixing of the stone and brick in the middle of the alley. The alley manual calls for 10% brick and 90% stone in the middle and a more 50-50 ratio at gathering and major entry locations.

Follow up items:

The design has been changed so that the rooftop coverage is 50% as allowed in the code 23.66.140 for use as an office

Code also requires that the penthouse be set back 15 feet. However, on the Buttnick building the setback does not comply with 15-foot set back requirement. The code does allow for the Board to modify the setbacks for rooftop features if the feature is minimally visible from 300 feet. The Board would first have to determine if the penthouse is minimally visible from 300 feet. The applicant demonstrated their structural argument for the location of the penthouse wall. Ms. Day noted the

limited visibility of the penthouse but was concerned that the dark banding on the top of the penthouse would make it more visible than if it was a lighter color. The applicant said they thought the opposite. Ms. Day noted that she had noticed most other penthouse proposals were a lighter color including one project that had recently revised their color to a lighter color after an NPS review.

**Areaways:**

The areaway for the Buttnick was reinforced with careful guidance from the Board to maintain the historical features it is rated “substantially intact/minor alterations.” The applicant clarified that they are not proposing any alterations to that areaway. City Loan building areaway is rated “new or significantly altered,” and the Grand Central is rated “substantially altered.” There is also an existing vault on the Main Street in the areaway. The applicant clarified that there would still be ventilation gates there. They said that the historic light pole would be maintained the existing location. They clarified that there are no prism lights in the locations of the areaway that are being affected.

**The proposal does not include:**

- Plants for the rooftop planter,
- Signage,
- Solar panels,
- Awning or canopies

**Draft Motion: I move to recommend granting a Certificate of Approval for:**

**Proposed alterations to the buildings including:**

- penthouse addition,
- replacement of windows and storefronts
- removing non original greenhouse structure
- adding new openings for new storefronts and doors and one vent,
- removing ivy and repairing brick,
- adding lighting,
- seismic upgrades,
- new rooftop mechanical equipment,

Retains type of uses but changes the floorplan of uses,

Alterations to the areaways, including a new section of sidewalk on Main ST

consistent with the Pioneer Square Standard for sidewalks,

Replacement of the alley pavers with all unused pavers to be careful salvage and stored with SDOT for a later use.

All as presented.

The Board directs staff to prepare a written recommendation of approval based on considering the application submittal and Board discussion at the *Aug 4, 2020* public meeting and forward this written recommendation to the Department of Neighborhoods Director.

**Code Citations:**

SMC 23.66.030 Certificates of Approval required

SMC 23.66.140 – Height

C. Rooftop features and additions to structures

3. The setbacks required for rooftop features may be modified by the Department of Neighborhoods Director, after a sight line review by the Preservation Board to ensure that the features are minimally visible from public streets and parks within 300 feet of the structure.

4. Height limits for rooftop features

b. For existing structures, open railings, planters, clerestories, skylights, play equipment, parapets, and firewalls may extend up to 4 feet above the roof of the structure or the maximum height limit, whichever is less. For new structures, such features may extend up to 4 feet above the maximum height limit. No rooftop coverage limits apply to such features regardless of whether the structure is existing or new.

d. The following rooftop features may extend up to 8 feet above the roof or maximum height limit, whichever is less, if they are set back a minimum of 15 feet from the street and 3 feet from an alley. They may extend up to 15 feet above the roof if set back a minimum of 30 feet from the street. A setback may not be required at common wall lines subject to review by the Preservation Board and approval by the Department of Neighborhoods Director. The combined coverage of the following listed rooftop features shall not exceed 15 percent of the roof area:

2) stair and elevator penthouses;

3) mechanical equipment;

4) minor communication utilities and accessory communication devices, except that height is regulated according to the provisions of [Section 23.57.014](#).

Additional combined coverage of these rooftop features, not to exceed 25 percent of the roof area, may be permitted subject to review by the Preservation Board and approval by the Department of Neighborhoods Director.

f. Residential and office penthouses

2) Office penthouses are permitted only if the footprint of the existing structure is greater than 10,000 square feet and the structure is at least 60 feet in height. When permitted, office penthouses shall be set back a minimum of 15 feet from all property lines and may cover a maximum of 50 percent of the total roof surface. Office penthouses may extend up to 12 feet above the roof of the structure and shall be functionally integrated into the existing structure.

3) The combined height of the structure and a residential penthouse or office penthouse, if permitted, shall not exceed the maximum height limit for that area of the District in which the structure is located.

g. Screening of rooftop features. Measures may be taken to screen rooftop features from public view subject to review by the Preservation Board and approval by the Department of Neighborhoods Director. The amount of rooftop area enclosed by rooftop screening may exceed the maximum percentage of the combined coverage of rooftop features listed in subsection 23.66.140.C.4.d. In no circumstances shall the height of rooftop screening exceed 15 feet above the maximum height limit or height of an addition permitted according to subsection 23.66.140.C.4.i or otherwise, whichever is higher.

#### **23.66.180 - Exterior building design.**

To complement and enhance the historic character of the District and to retain the quality and continuity of existing buildings, the following requirements shall apply to exterior building design:

A. Materials. Unless an alternative material is approved by the Department of Neighborhoods Director following Board review and recommendation, exterior building facades shall be brick, concrete tinted a subdued or earthen color, sandstone or similar stone facing material commonly used in the District. Aluminum, painted metal, wood and other materials may be used for signs, window and door sashes and trim, and for similar purposes when approved by the Department of Neighborhoods Director as compatible with adjacent or original uses, following Board review and recommendation.

B. Scale. Exterior building facades shall be of a scale compatible with surrounding structures. Window proportions, floor height, cornice line, street elevations and other elements of the building facades shall relate to the scale of the buildings in the immediate area.

#### **Pioneer Square Preservation District Rules**

##### **III. GENERAL GUIDELINES FOR REHABILITATION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION**

In addition to the Pioneer Square Preservation District Ordinance and Rules, The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, and the complete series of Historic Buildings Preservation Briefs developed by the National Park Service shall serve as guidelines for proposed exterior alterations and treatments, rehabilitation projects, and new construction. (7/99)

Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. (7/99) In considering rehabilitation projects, what is critical is the stabilization of significant historical detailing, respect for the original architectural style, and compatibility of scale and materials.

The following architectural elements are typical throughout the District and will be used by the Board in the evaluation of requests for design approval:

- A. Site. The property line is the line of the building mass. Street facades are uniformly located at the front property lines, thus there is a strong street edge definition. Building cornices, bay windows and ornament project beyond the main wall surface of some facades.
- B. Design. Building design is generally typified by horizontal divisions which create distinctive base and cap levels. Facades may also be divided vertically by pilasters or wide piers which form repetitive window bays. Street facades are also distinguished by heavy terminal cornices and parapets, ornamental storefronts and entrance bays and repetitive window sizes and placement.
- C. Building materials. The most common facing materials are brick masonry and cut or rusticated sandstone, with limited use of terra cotta and tile. Wooden window sash, ornamental sheet metal, carved stone and wooden or cast iron storefronts are also typically used throughout the District. Synthetic stucco siding materials are generally not permitted. (7/99)
- D. Color. Building facades are primarily composed of varied tones of red brick masonry or gray sandstone. Unfinished brick, stone, or concrete masonry unit surfaces may not be painted. Painted color is typically applied to wooden window sash, sheet metal ornament and wooden or cast iron storefronts. Paint colors shall be appropriate to ensure compatibility within the District. (7/99)
- E. Building Base. Buildings are allowed a base of approximately 18-24 inches. Base materials should be concrete, sandstone, or granite, and may be poured, cut to fit or unit-paved. The color relationship between the sidewalk and building must be considered. Brick or tile materials should not be used except when existing walks are of the same material.

## XVII. SIDEWALK TREATMENT

### A. Standards

Sidewalk paving and improvements shall be completed with one pound lamp-black per cubic yard of concrete, scored at two-foot intervals. This material shall be used for all projects of 1/4 block or greater size. On small projects, if it is feasible, sidewalk material may be selected as for all projects of 1/4 block or greater size. On small projects, if it is feasible, sidewalk material may be selected to match adjacent sidewalks in color, pattern and texture.

## XVIII. AREAWAYS

Areaways are usable areas constructed under the sidewalk between the building foundation and street wall. Areaways were created after the Great Seattle Fire of 1889 when the District was rebuilt and the street elevations

were raised. Building standards adopted shortly after the fire required fireproof sidewalk construction to replace the pre-fire wooden sidewalks. Areaways are part of the City's right-of-way area, however, the space is often available for use by the adjacent building owner. (7/03)

The most significant qualities of an areaway are its volume of space, which provides a record of its history, and the architectural features that render its form, character, and spatial quality. These features include use of unit materials (brick or stone), bays articulated by arches and/or columns, ceiling vaults, and other special features including tilework or skylights (sidewalk prism lenses). The historic characteristics of areaways shall be preserved. (7/03)

In 2001, the Seattle Department of Transportation completed a survey of approximately 100 areaways in the District. Each areaway was rated in terms of its structural condition and presence of original historic characteristics. A range of structural repairs options were proposed based on the structural and historical ratings. The 2001 Seattle Department of Transportation Areaway Survey shall serve as a guide for the Board's decision making on future alterations or repairs to areaways in the District. (7/03)

## XIX. ALLEYS

- A. Alley Paving. Alleys are to be paved with unit paving materials. Three types are acceptable in the District: remolded paving bricks, cobbles, and interlocking brick-tone pavers. Alleys should be repaired or re-paved in the original unit material when these materials remain available. All other alleys should be paved with remolded brick. The center drainage swale, peculiar to alleys, should be preserved as part of alley re-paving. Unit paved alleys should not be patched with any material other than approved unit paving.

## Secretary of Interior's Standards

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as

adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced.

Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

9. New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

[Preservation Brief 3: Improving Energy Efficiency in Historic Buildings](#)

[Preservation Brief 14: New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings Concerns](#)

[Preservation Brief 41 Seismic improvements](#)

[Interpreting the Standards 21: Adding new openings on secondary elevations](#)

[Pioneer Square Alley Design Manual](#)



Issued: July 29, 2021

Genna Nashem  
Pioneer Square Preservation Board Coordinator